





Der Wissenschaftsfonds.

# Longitudinal thermalization via the chromo-Weibel instability

Maximilian Attems Frankfurt Institute of Advanced Studies

arXiv:1207.5795

Collaborators: Anton Rebhan, Michael Strickland

November 22, 2012

Transport Seminar, 2012



Physical Observables

#### Motivation

SU(N) Yang-Mills field dynamics

Weakly coupled inspired by Hard Thermal Loops (HTL)Real-time physical quantities of non-equilibrium processesPlasma turbulence affects parton transport (isotropization, jet energy loss, viscosity,..)Early time dynamics of the quark gluon plasma

Derivation of time scales for the isotropization, thermalization



Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

## Hard Expanding Loops (HEL)

Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops - Boltzmann - Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate **Physical Observables** HEL checks Energy densities fields Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Al le

Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization



Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

## Hard-Expanding Loops Assumptions

Free streaming background

Anisotropy in momentum space

SU(2) particle content

Fixed transverse size

Extrapolate to  $\alpha_s \sim 0.3$ 

Match CGC  $n(\tau_0) \propto Q_s^3 \alpha_s^{-1}$ 



#### Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

#### Stages of the Little Big Bang



[Gelis 2010] Illustration of the stages of a heavy ion collision. This work focuses on the early phase with strong fields in an out of equilibrium situation.



## Scales of weakly coupled QGP

- Hard Expanding Loops (HEL)
- Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang
- Scales QGP
- Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes
- growth rate
- Physical Observables

- $\bullet T: energy of hard particles$ 
  - gT: thermal masses, Debye screening mass, Landau damping
- $g^2T$ : magnetic confinement, color relaxation, rate for small angle scattering
- $g^4T$ : rate for large angle scattering,  $\eta^{-1}T^4$



## Scales of weakly coupled QGP

- Hard Expanding Loops (HEL)
- Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang
- Scales QGP
- Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate
- Physical Observables

- $\bullet T: energy of hard particles$ 
  - gT: thermal masses, Debye screening mass,
    Landau damping, plasma instabilities [Mrowczynski 1988,
    1993, ..]
- $g^2T$ : magnetic confinement, color relaxation, rate for small angle scattering
- $g^4T$ : rate for large angle scattering,  $\eta^{-1}T^4$



Loops (HEL) Assumptions

Scales QGP

instabilities

Boltzmann -

Weibel

Loops -

Vlasov Bjorken

expansion Equation of

motions Lattice parameters

growth rate

Observables

Physical

### Weibel instabilities



[Strickland 2006]: Illustration of the mechanism of filamentation instabilities.



Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

## Hard (Thermal) Loops - Boltzmann - Vlasov

Assuming free streaming, one solves the gauge covariant Boltzmann-Vlasov equation

$$v \cdot D\partial f_a(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t) = g v_\mu F_a^{\mu\nu} \partial_\nu^{(p)} f_0(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t)$$
(1)



Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate Physical

Observables

Hard (Thermal) Loops - Boltzmann - Vlasov

Assuming free streaming, one solves the gauge covariant Boltzmann-Vlasov equation

$$v \cdot D\partial f_a(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t) = g v_\mu F_a^{\mu\nu} \partial_\nu^{(p)} f_0(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t)$$
(1)

coupled to Yang-Mills equation

$$D_{\mu}F_{a}^{\mu\nu} = j_{a}^{\nu} = g \int \frac{d^{3}p}{(2\pi)^{3}} \frac{p^{\mu}}{2p^{0}} \delta f_{a}(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t)$$
(2)



Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

## Hard (Thermal) Loops - Boltzmann - Vlasov

Assuming free streaming, one solves the gauge covariant Boltzmann-Vlasov equation

$$v \cdot D\partial f_a(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t) = g v_\mu F_a^{\mu\nu} \partial_\nu^{(p)} f_0(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t)$$
(1)

coupled to Yang-Mills equation

$$D_{\mu}F_{a}^{\mu\nu} = j_{a}^{\nu} = g \int \frac{d^{3}p}{(2\pi)^{3}} \frac{p^{\mu}}{2p^{0}} \delta f_{a}(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t)$$
(2)

in the HTL approximation

$$gA_{\mu} \ll |\mathbf{p}_{hard}|,$$
 (3)



Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

## Hard (Thermal) Loops - Boltzmann - Vlasov

Assuming free streaming, one solves the gauge covariant Boltzmann-Vlasov equation

$$v \cdot D\partial f_a(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t) = g v_\mu F_a^{\mu\nu} \partial_\nu^{(p)} f_0(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t)$$
(1)

coupled to Yang-Mills equation

$$D_{\mu}F_{a}^{\mu\nu} = j_{a}^{\nu} = g \int \frac{d^{3}p}{(2\pi)^{3}} \frac{p^{\mu}}{2p^{0}} \delta f_{a}(\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{x}, t)$$
(2)

in the HTL approximation

$$gA_{\mu} \ll |\mathbf{p}_{hard}|, \qquad (3)$$

## the Romatschke, Strickland background distribution function $f_0(p_{\perp}, \tilde{p}_{\eta}) = f_{\text{CGC}} ([\mathbf{p}^2 + \xi(\tau)(\mathbf{p} \cdot \mathbf{\hat{n}})^2] / p_{\text{hard}}^2(\tau))^{0.5}. \quad (4)$



#### Bjorken expansion



Hard Expanding Loops (HEL)

Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov

Bjorken .

expansion

Equation of motions Lattice

parameters

Unstable modes

growth rate

Physical Observables



Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang

#### Bjorken expansion



Bjorken expansion

Scales QGP

instabilities

Boltzmann -

Hard (Thermal)

Weibel

Loops -

Vlasov

Equation of motions Lattice parameters

Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables It is convenient to switch to comoving coordinates

 $t = \tau \cosh \eta , \qquad \qquad \tau = \sqrt{t^2 - z^2} ,$  $z = \tau \sinh \eta , \qquad \qquad \eta = \operatorname{arctanh} \frac{z}{t} , \qquad (5)$ 

with the corresponding metric

$$ds^{2} = d\tau^{2} - d\mathbf{x}_{\perp}^{2} - \tau^{2} d\eta^{2} \,. \tag{6}$$



Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang

Scales QGP

instabilities

Boltzmann -

Hard (Thermal)

Unstable modes

growth rate

Physical Observables

Weibel

Loops -

Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters **Equation of motions** 

#### Yang-Mills equations

$$\tau^{-1}\partial_{\tau}\Pi_{i} = j^{i} - D_{j}F^{ji} - D_{\eta}F^{\eta i}, \qquad (7)$$
  
$$\tau\partial_{\tau}\Pi^{\eta} = j_{\eta} - D_{i}F^{i}{}_{\eta}. \qquad (8)$$

Canonical conjugate field momenta

$$\Pi^{i} \equiv \tau \partial_{\tau} A_{i}, \quad \Pi^{\eta} \equiv \frac{1}{\tau} \partial_{\tau} A_{\eta} \,. \tag{9}$$

Transport Seminar, 2012

#### 11 / 33



Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -

Vlasov Bjorken

expansion

#### Equation of

#### motions

Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

## **Equation of motions**

#### Yang-Mills equations

$$\tau^{-1}\partial_{\tau}\Pi_{i} = j^{i} - D_{j}F^{ji} - D_{\eta}F^{\eta i}, \qquad (7)$$

$$\tau \partial_{\tau} \Pi^{\eta} = j_{\eta} - D_i F^i{}_{\eta} \,. \tag{8}$$

$$\Pi^{i} \equiv \tau \partial_{\tau} A_{i}, \quad \Pi^{\eta} \equiv \frac{1}{\tau} \partial_{\tau} A_{\eta} \,. \tag{9}$$

The expression for the currents is

$$j^{\alpha}(\tau, \mathbf{x}_{\perp}, \eta) = -\frac{m_D^2}{2} \int_0^{2\pi} \frac{d\phi}{2\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} d\bar{y} \, V^{\alpha} \, \overline{\mathcal{W}}(\tau, \mathbf{x}_{\perp}, \eta; \phi, \bar{y}) \,,$$
$$m_D^2 = -g^2 t_R \int_0^{\infty} \frac{dp \, p^2}{(2\pi)^2} f'_{\rm iso}(p) \,. \tag{10}$$

#### Transport Seminar, 2012



Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of

#### motions

Lattice

parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

## Equation of motions II

### The auxiliary fields satisfy

$$\partial_{\tau}\overline{\mathcal{W}}(\tau, \mathbf{x}_{\perp}, \eta; \phi, \bar{y}) = -\frac{1}{\cosh \bar{y}} \left[ v^{i} D_{i} \overline{\mathcal{W}} + \frac{\sinh \bar{y}}{\tau} \left( D_{\eta} \overline{\mathcal{W}} - \partial_{\bar{y}} \overline{\mathcal{W}} \right) \right] + \frac{1}{\bar{f}(\tau, \tau_{\rm iso}, \bar{y})} \left[ \frac{1}{\tau} v^{i} \Pi_{i} - \frac{\tau^{2} \sinh \bar{y}}{\tau_{\rm iso}^{2}} \Pi^{\eta} + \frac{\tanh \bar{y}}{\tau} \left( 1 - \frac{\tau^{2}}{\tau_{\rm iso}^{2}} \right) v^{i} F_{i\eta} \right],$$
(11)

by replacing y with  $\bar{y} \equiv y - \eta$  and

$$\bar{f}(\tau, \tau_{\rm iso}, \bar{y}) = \left(1 + \frac{\tau^2}{\tau_{\rm iso}^2} \sinh^2 \bar{y}\right)^2.$$
(12)



#### Equation of motions III

Hard Expanding Loops (HEL)

Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions

Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables We can translate the continuum equations of motion into gauge-invariant lattice equations of motion by using standard plaquette and staple operators

$$(F_{k\eta})^a = \frac{iN_c}{a_\eta} \operatorname{tr} \left[\tau^a U_{\Box,k\eta}\right]$$
(13)

with the standard plaquette  

$$U_{\Box,\mu\nu}(x) = U_{\mu}(x)U_{\nu}(x+\mu)U_{\mu}^{\dagger}(x+\nu)U_{\nu}^{\dagger}(x).$$
  
Express the covariant derivatives of the field strength tensor

$$(D_{\eta}F_{\eta j})^{a} = \frac{iN_{c}}{a_{\eta}^{2}}\operatorname{tr}\left[\tau^{a}U_{j}(\tau,x)\sum_{|\eta|\neq j}S_{j\eta}^{\dagger}(\tau,x)\right]$$
(14)

#### with the gauge link staple

$$S^{\dagger}_{\mu\nu}(\tau, x) = U_{\nu}(\tau, x + \mu) U^{\dagger}_{\mu}(\tau, x + \nu) U^{\dagger}_{\nu}(\tau, x) .$$
 (15)



Hard Expanding

Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters

Unstable modes

growth rate

Physical Observables Lattice parameters

The  $\eta$  lattice spacing is determined by

$$\nu_{\min} = \frac{2\pi}{N_{\eta}a_{\eta}} \ll 5.$$
 (16)

The infrared cutoff in the transverse direction fullfills

$$k_{\min} = \frac{2\pi}{N_{\perp}a} \ll 0.2 \,\tau_0^{-1} \,. \tag{17}$$

The time dependent longitudinal UV cutoff

$$\nu_{\max} = \frac{\pi}{a_{\eta}\tau} \gg 30 \tag{18}$$

and the constant transverse UV cutoff should be comparable

$$k_{\max} = \frac{\pi}{a} \gg Q_s \,. \tag{19}$$



#### Unstable modes growth rate

Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables



General k growth rates for the  $\alpha$  and - modes for  $\xi = 10$  with general k as  $\theta = \arctan(k_{\perp}/k_{\eta})$ 

![](_page_20_Picture_0.jpeg)

Hard Expanding Loops (HEL) Assumptions Stages of the Little Big Bang Scales QGP Weibel instabilities Hard (Thermal) Loops -Boltzmann -Vlasov Bjorken expansion Equation of motions Lattice parameters Unstable modes growth rate

Physical Observables

#### Unstable modes growth rate

![](_page_20_Figure_4.jpeg)

Unstable mode spectra of purely longitudinal modes for specific anisotropies:  $N(\tau) \approx \exp(2m_D \sqrt{\tau \tau_{\rm CGC}})$ 

![](_page_21_Picture_0.jpeg)

Weibel

Loops -

Vlasov Bjorken expansion

motions

Lattice

Physical

#### Anisotropy occupancy

![](_page_21_Figure_2.jpeg)

[Kurkela, Moore 2012]: Thermalization in Weakly Coupled Nonabelian Plasmas.

![](_page_22_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra Longitudinal thermalization Expanding 3D+3V non-Abelian Plasma Instabilities

Hard Expanding Loops (HEL)
Assumptions
Stages of the Little Big Bang
Scales QGP
Weibel instabilities
Hard (Thermal) Loops - Boltzmann - Vlasov
Bjorken expansion
Equation of motions
Lattice parameters
Unstable modes growth rate

#### **Physical Observables**

HEL checks
Energy densities fields
Pressures
Pressure ratio
Non-Abelian spectra
Abelian spectra
Longitudinal thermalization

![](_page_23_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Physical Observables

#### HEL checks

Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra Longitudinal

thermalization

## HEL checks

3D+3V fixed box limit

![](_page_23_Figure_11.jpeg)

1D+3V semi-analytical results

![](_page_23_Figure_13.jpeg)

![](_page_24_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks

Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra Longitudinal thermalization

![](_page_24_Figure_8.jpeg)

![](_page_24_Figure_9.jpeg)

![](_page_25_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra Longitudinal thermalization

## Energy densities fields

![](_page_25_Figure_8.jpeg)

Figure 3: 50 averaged runs  $N_{\perp} * N_{\eta} * N_{u} * N_{\phi} = 40^{2} * 128 * 128 * 32$ : after onset one sees **rapid growth of**  $B_{l}$  **and**  $E_{L}$  **fields**, followed by non-Abelian interactions kick in.

![](_page_26_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

## Energy densities fields

![](_page_26_Figure_8.jpeg)

Figure 4: Total field energy density for different initial current fluctuation magnitudes showing similar behavior (apart from non-Abelian point).

![](_page_27_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

#### Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

#### Pressures

![](_page_27_Figure_8.jpeg)

Figure 5: Initially highly anisotropic, note  $P_{L,\text{field}}(\tau = 0.3) < 0$ , growing field pressures,  $P_{L,\text{field}}$  dominates at late times,  $\tilde{\tau}$  scaled  $P_L$  drops  $\propto 1/\tilde{\tau}^2$ .

![](_page_28_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio

Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

#### Pressure ratio

![](_page_28_Figure_10.jpeg)

Figure 6: Chromo-Weibel instability **restores isotropy** on fm/c scale, at  $\tilde{\tau} \approx 6$ .

![](_page_29_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio

Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

#### Pressure ratio

![](_page_29_Figure_10.jpeg)

Figure 7: Different initial current fluctuation magnitudes  $\Delta$  effecting the isotropization time.

![](_page_30_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra Longitudinal thermalization

## Non-Abelian spectra

![](_page_30_Figure_8.jpeg)

Figure 8: Fourier transform each E and B chromofields and sum all the components: rapid emergence of an exponential distribution of longitudinal energy.

![](_page_31_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

#### Abelian spectra

![](_page_31_Figure_9.jpeg)

Figure 9: Longitudinal spectra for **abelian** runs shows amplification of the initial seeded modes.

![](_page_32_Picture_0.jpeg)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

![](_page_32_Figure_8.jpeg)

Figure 10: The **red-shifting** is even more visible in the  $k_z$  plot. Nonlinear mode-mode coupling is vital in order to populate high momentum modes.

![](_page_33_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

## Spectra fits

![](_page_33_Figure_9.jpeg)

Massless Boltzmann distribution fits the longitudinal spectra:

$$\mathcal{E}_{\rm fit}(k_z) = A\left(k_z^2 + 2|k_z|T + 2T^2\right) \exp\left(-|k_z|/T\right)$$
(20)

Comparison of data and fit function at six different  $\tilde{\tau}$ .

![](_page_34_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Longitudinal thermalization

![](_page_34_Figure_2.jpeg)

Figure 11: First the soft sector cools down. Due to the instability longitudinal soft **fields reheats**.

![](_page_35_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

## Outlook

## Experimental signatures

- Larger longitudinal  $N_{\eta}$  (longitudinal parallellization)
- Improved IC conditions:  $k_{\perp}$  cutoff
- Spectral analysis  $f_A(k), f_E(k)$
- Probe diagramm with modified  $f_0$
- Incorporate backreaction

![](_page_36_Picture_0.jpeg)

Conclusions

Hard Expanding Loops (HEL)

Physical Observables

HEL checks Energy densities fields

Pressures

Pressure ratio Non-Abelian spectra

Abelian spectra

Longitudinal thermalization

#### We performed the **first real-time 3d numerical** study of non-Abelian plasma in a longitudinally expanding system within hard expanding loops **HEL**.

- The **momentum space anisotropy** can persist for quite some time.
- There doesn't seem to be a "soft scale" saturation of the instability as was seen in static boxes.
- The longitudinal spectra seem to be well described by a Boltzmann distribution indicating rapid longitudinal thermalization of the gauge fields.

We are now studying even larger lattices in order to better understand the infrared dynamics. Real-time lattice parameters of the hamiltonian evolution in temporal axial gauge:

longitudinal lattice spacing	$a_{\eta}$	0.025
transverse lattice spacing	a	$Q_s^{-1}$
temporal time step	$\epsilon$	$10^{-2}\tau_0$
first time step	$ au_0$	$1/Q_s$
longitudinal lattice points	$N_{\eta}$	128
transverse lattice points	$N_{\perp}$	40
lattice size in velocity space	$N_u \times N_\phi$	$128 \times 32$
coupling constant	g	$(3.77)^{0.5}$

Assuming for LHC collisions

$$Q_s \sim 2 \text{GeV} = (0.1 \text{fm})^{-1}$$
 (21)

We match to CGC values

$$n(\tau_0) = c \frac{N_g Q_s^3}{4\pi^2 N_c \alpha_s (Q_s \tau_0)} \tag{22}$$

with the gluon liberation factor  $c = 2 \ln 2$ . From this one can determine the CGC Debye mass

$$m_D^2(\tau_{\rm CGC}) = 1.285/(\tau_0 \tau_{\rm CGC}).$$
 (23)